**Minutes**

**Joint Municipal Action Committee**

Friday, May 14, 2021

8:00 a.m. – 9:30 a.m.

Remote meeting via Zoom

**CALL TO ORDER**

 Chair Elizabeth Bonbright called the meeting to order at 8:03 a.m.

**ROLL CALL - JMAC COMMITTEE**

Elizabeth Bonbright, Chair, Tacoma Public Schools
Kristina Walker, Vice-Chair, City of Tacoma

Jesse Baines, Metro Parks Tacoma

Andrea Smith, Metro Parks Tacoma

Marty Campbell, Pierce County

Ryan Mello, Pierce County
Deanna Keller, Port of Tacoma

Korey Strozier, Tacoma Public Schools

**JMAC CHIEF EXECUTIVES**

Elizabeth Pauli, City of Tacoma

Shon Sylvia, Metro Parks Tacoma

Anthony Chen, Tacoma/Pierce County Health Department

Carla Santorno, Tacoma Public Schools

# **GUESTS IN ATTENDANCE**

Nick Bayard, City of Tacoma

Tanisha Jumper, City of Tacoma

Kurtis Kingsolver, City of Tacoma

Rosa McLeod, City of Tacoma

Jeff Robinson, City of Tacoma

Chrisy Vindivich, City of Tacoma

Hunter George, Metro Parks Tacoma

Tim Reid, Metro Parks Tacoma

Catherine Rudolph, Pierce County

Alexandra Mather, Pierce Transit

Ryan Wheaton, Pierce Transit

Sean Ergan, Port of Tacoma

Sally Perkins, Practical Solutions

Joseph Sterling, Rainforest Strategies

Joshua Garcia, Tacoma Public Schools

Tracy Jones, Tacoma Public Schools

 **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

It was moved and seconded that the agenda be approved; passed unanimously.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

It was moved and seconded that the minutes of April 9th, 2021 be approved; passed unanimously.

**AGENDA ITEMS**

**Discussion with Chief Executives: Asset Mapping Tool – Elizabeth Bonbright:**

Over the past weeks, we have collectively been compiling an innovation ecosystem Asset Map with 3 Themes: Justice, Equity, Diversity & Inclusion (JEDI); Public Health and Safety; and Community Wealth Building.

As you reflect on this work with the innovation asset map, if you see opportunities to collaborate with colleagues from other entities, make that move!

The Summit of 60 is being pushed to the fall, but we will focus on engaging with community in the meantime.

**Asset and Initiative Map – Joe Sterling:**

The 3 strategic themes that have emerged so far are:

* Social Justice (JEDI: Justice, Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion),
* Public Health and Safety, and
* Building Community Wealth.

Progress can’t really be made on one without making progress on all, they’re so deeply intertwined.

The 6 attributes that have been identified for the asset map, which are found in any innovation ecosystem are:

* Frameworks, policies and infrastructure
* Role models
* Activities and engagements
* Resources of capital, information, and person-hours being dedicated
* Leadership
* Culture, or “the way we do things here”

The information shown in the asset map are only from some of the agencies. It doesn’t reflect all the work being done in the community. This is the first pass at organizing the information so the map will grow as new information is submitted. Each broad category has “Initial Thoughts” that Hunter George and Joe Sterling put together, which are intended to be starting points for conversations. This is a living, breathing, catalog that will evolve. It will be moved to the JMAC website in the future.

Here is a link to the current draft of the asset map tool. <https://sites.google.com/rfs-llp.com/jmac-asset-initiative-map/home>

Here is a link to the submission form, which goes to Joe and Hunter to edit before posting on the live site. <https://docs.google.com/forms/d/e/1FAIpQLSe1nah2tKx1HGHmSCoW3Tt3nIEU69yak-tm-0zgTE2pbU_hBg/viewform>

**Elizabeth Bonbright (Chair) & Kristina Walker (Vice Chair) led the group in a discussion:**

**QUESTION 1: Frameworks, Policies, and Infrastructure – Elizabeth Bonbright**

***Many of us have policies and goals designed to support minority and women-owned businesses (MWBE). Can we improve our collective effort to help local firms in the MWBE (Minority and Women-Owned Businesses) universe meet the need and boost the number of qualified local firms?***

* Carla Santorno: Let’s get a network we can share to let them get the best access to the pool. Second, build the pool and make it better; right now it is a shallow pool. To help build a better pool, we should have joint training for minorities. The more we create the network and share policies, it will help them use this in a better way. Share our policies and goals.
* Alex Mather: Hold a semi-annual public procurement seminar to share our lists for MWBEs.
* Catherine Rudolph: Agree we should do joint training. They are doing “groundwater training” from the Racial Institute. One question was “do we have the bond set too high” for a beginning company to use? They’re doing an analysis of purchasing practices to make sure they’re more open to more. They can’t legally say they’ll only hire people from Pierce county, but they don’t want to ignore people from the area who may not know how to engage and submit for bids. Omit the barriers.
* Jesse Baines: It would be helpful to streamline the rosters. It’s hard to learn the different management systems. Develop a system that works county-wide, which helps them through the process.
* Deanna Keller: She has been through SBA and women-owned business processes. We need to ask the question, “What is our purpose in doing this? If you get put on a list, what does that give you?” It didn’t do anything for her. It wasn’t very beneficial – it involved a lot of paperwork, interviews, etc. for nothing. We need to figure out what purpose and goal is. Are we really trying to promote minority-owned business or just putting them on the list or asking people to consider them first, which hasn’t been done?
* Jeff Robinson: About 1.5 years ago, we eliminated the City roster and are now using the State’s roster for minority-owned, woman-owned businesses. We’ve also established equity and contracting program goals for utilization of MWBEs and Disadvantaged Business Enterprises (DBEs) in all our contracts. If someone does not meet the goal for the bid and utilization on minority contracts, they don’t get the bid. If there aren’t enough types of the businesses that they need to have bid for the projects, there is a waiver. Pre-COVID they were holding monthly workshops to train minority/women owned businesses on how to interact with the City, how to do the paperwork, how to contract with the City. We have a minority business development agency (MBDA), which is a federal agency, but it’s housed in City of Tacoma offices. They just received their second large technical assistance grant from the US Department of Commerce, so they’ll be hosting more workshops. Before, they didn’t have a way to know which businesses that got business licenses fell into this particular pool. They are now working with a national organization to cross-list City of Tacoma business licenses with those that they have information on regarding ownership of the actual business.
* Anthony Chen: If the system isn’t working, making lists doesn’t work. We must understand the preferences/cultural practices of these groups. For example, culturally, black people are very expressive, whereas Asian people are more quiet and reserved. If you have a system that rewards self-promotion, that discriminates against people/culture groups who tend to be more reserved. Making people conform to the system doesn’t work – we need to change the system. We also need to proactively create systems and processes that work to the strengths of the people we’re trying to help.
* Josh Garcia: We need to start with setting production goals, not just process goals. Publicly recording them is an important piece. In a common pipeline the process has to be the same. Each agency should be encouraged to go through a lean sigma process to find and remove barriers. TPS has been doing Community Inclusion commitment reports on a quarterly and annual basis to hold ourselves accountable. Over time, this helps build trust with the community when they can see the metrics are moving. There are opportunities to build future business owners. We need to think about the pipeline: a paid apprenticeship program to work with MWBE-owned businesses, Summer Jobs 523 internships, et cetera. There is not a big bucket of resources of business owners, so we need to help grow them.
* Jesse Baines: There are a lot of trainings/workshops/outreach that government agencies do, but there’s not enough DBEs on these jobs. Historically, government agencies have only served one population – so how do we shift that support to help groups who’ve been financially disenfranchised historically. There needs to be an intentional investment in these groups.
* Ryan Mello: Pierce County has recently appropriated about ~$5M minority-owned business technical assistance support, as well as support to invest in new entrepreneurs and other small Black, Indigenous and people of color (BIPOC) owned businesses.
* Elizabeth Bonbright: It seems like it would be easy to have a universal roster application to create/use.

CHAT COMMENTS:

Joshua Garcia, Tacoma Public Schools: We should about think about - starting with goals that are grounded in data metrics (common among agencies), develop a pipe line for business procurement, each participate in a lean sigma process to identify barriers, have a public report, develop a pipeline into K12 to introduce the next generation to the opportunities.

Korey Strozier, Tacoma Public Schools: General Answer here, short answer yes. It’s absolutely great to plan to help/uplift or consider a particular group. To have it as action items on agenda’s is cute but the real work comes from intentional action steps to uplift the MWBE universe. The question then becomes how are we spotlighting these efforts and how are we communicating the message? How do we come together to provide financial, technical and legal assistance to aspiring entrepreneurs? Yes, some of our orgs may have policies in place to support minority and women owned businesses, but some of our policies haven’t been revisited or viewed in many years— I say yes overall, the effort and action must be intentional

Deanna Keller, Port of Tacoma Commissioner: This is actually a huge issue. How do we lift up our minority owned businesses? Not only the paperwork is daunting, it costs $$$$.

Catherine Rudolph, Pierce County: Yes. Not just a check box but a plan for access and success.

Deanna Keller, Port of Tacoma Commissioner: But for what purpose? Putting businesses on a list doesn't create change.

Jessie Baines, Metro Parks Tacoma: I would agree with Deanna, putting them on a list does not specifically help them, it will help them have the opportunity to bid on a wider range of jobs but specific financial support is needed to create a level playing field.

Ryan Mello, Pierce County: Jesse, what would the financial help to these businesses look like exactly? For what specific purpose - what is the agency buying? Also, your thoughts on giving more "bonus" points during the bidding process - does that increase the ability for access to opportunity when competing?

Sally Perkins, Community Member: Local report from Workforce Central on local wage gaps by gender and race. <https://workforce-central.org/2021/01/28/wage-discrepancy-report/>

**QUESTION 2: Activities and Engagements – Kristina Walker**

***Anchor’s Network has a key goal of improving local hiring; JMAC has a strategic theme of building community wealth through business ownership, so how can we align these efforts to ensure greater success with both hiring and business ownership?***

* Tanisha Jumper: The Anchor Institutions are a group of 10 agencies working together, including Bates Technical College, University of Puget Sound, University of Washington, Tacoma Public Schools, Tacoma Housing Authority, Pierce Transit, Metro Parks, the Greater Tacoma Community Foundation, Multi-Care, and Franciscan Health. These institutions have been meeting for several years to figure out two major areas of community wealth building, which are local hiring and local procurement. They have had a lot of conversations about how to do hiring locally, minority and women-owned businesses. What would local hiring look like? Anchor definition: *A large organization that can’t just pick up and leave; they are anchored in the community, they have tremendous buying and hiring power.* How do we strategically align those in order to get the biggest benefits in your community? They’re looking at how to build those relationships to advance Tacoma 2025, which is the city’s overall strategic plan. By 2025 they need to have a new strategic plan, so they want to be in alignment with the work of JMAC.
* Korey Strozier: Sometimes you can’t find what or who you need locally. How do we use that as an opportunity to train up? Are we taking into account the missed opportunities to hire locally? Is there a way to put out community feelers to engage interest; is that something we could collectively champion?
* Tanisha Jumper: Nationally, we have learned in Anchors that you have to be strategic in knowing where people are and aren’t coming from. For example, Multi-care always has positions they can’t fill. We should use tools like the city’s equity index to know where people are hired from, how much they’re making and then make specific programs to help them. We need to make intentional investments in neighborhoods that need it to get people into the pipelines to fill these positions and moving people.
* Kristina Walker: There’s also work being done with the National League of Cities and Workforce Central. That program will be rolling out that program this year.
* Catherine Rudolph: One asset that needs integrated into planning is people who separate from their military training and stay or return here. There’s a general disconnect between the civilian understanding of what this asset represents and what training we could do to help them prepare for a civilian career.
* Deanna Keller: The Port of Tacoma is working on development of a Maritime high school situation, as well as workforce development. They’re also working with TPS Career and Technical Education (CTE), and Katie Condit’s WorkForce Central development council. They’re just beginning this. Another group to reach out to would the Greater Tacoma Community Foundation (Kathy Whitman), as they’re funding a lot of the things we’re trying to get done.
* Josh Garcia: Tacoma Public Schools has been trying to build an out-of-school time intermediary for kids. When you have a plan of “what are all the different activities”, there are several partners who play different roles. We need to consider the different workstreams that need to be addressed and who in the community is doing each workstream. This is complex work, and not one of us is doing everything. We should think about who should be involved in doing next pieces?
* Jesse Baines: We often try to reinvent the wheel and create new systems, for example when we talk about hiring locally. We need to lean on the community, it would help us find a larger workforce. There are many disadvantaged businesses that hire locally. That’s where the majority of our work is. A lot of these are hiring outside of the city. Leaning into these local businesses would financially invest in those businesses, but we keep going to outside agencies. We need to connect with the local companies who are already here on the ground and giving them the funds they need to do what needs to be done.
* Tanisha Jumper: There was a question in the chat about why we don’t include private businesses in the Anchor Institutions framework. It’s a starting point. It’s not that we don’t work with for-profits, but they don’t have the same commitment to communities as non-profits do (invested in the community). The focus is on those places that cannot move. There is a lot of literature regarding getting anchors to behave differently. It can really change the trajectory of high numbers of people rather than just a few. For example, getting businesses to make a commitment to use local restaurants vs. chains, et cetera.
* Kristina Walker: This is a great reminder that none of our groups operate independently.
* Hunter George: When thinking of “building ownership” and hiring locally, Joe Sterling and I discussed connecting with Columbia Bank, which is based here. Could credit unions be a good model, as they’re locally based? Would they help invest in the types of things we’re talking about?
* Joseph Sterling: Part of the Community wealth building concept is beyond “how inexpensively can we get something done?” There’s tremendous value in building the experience of local self-determination; the experience and practice of citizens in the community expressing their power and choice of what their financial institutions are doing. Consistent with the Anchors program, to the extent that you can build businesses that are locally owned and operated, that’s a far better thing than having companies that are expert at extracting labor at low wages or low security. Citizens aren’t very effective if they are always in hunger, housing, or healthcare insecurity. If you’re a local entity, you’re going to be taking care of your own.

CHAT COMMENTS:

Deanna Keller, Port of Tacoma: Tanisha, great comments regarding anchor businesses and businesses that can move.

Ryan, from my experience, only the federal government asks for DBE businesses. Somewhat with state construction but they do get credits for using minority owned businesses.

Sally Perkins, Community Member: Here is a key quote from the WFC local wage report:

"Still, it’s striking that the median wage for men in Pierce County without a high school diploma is higher than the median wage among women with some college or an associate’s degree. Among women who earn a graduate degree, the median pay is $1,486 less than men with a bachelor’s degree and $21,662 less than men with a comparable level of education."

Jessie Baines, Metro Parks Tacoma: Historically the city of Tacoma and many other government agencies have given tax breaks/incentives to construction companies/ developers to increase economic development. How do we provide these same type of Financial incentives for minority owned businesses? Is it access to capital (cash flow), is it building partnerships with supplies to help the DBE reduce costs, is it building relationships with foreign governments to help these DBE’s do better. We do all of these things currently for large developers/General Contractors

Sally Perkins, Community Member: So local hiring needs to take into account existing gaps, especially if part of the purpose is to build community wealth.

Anthony Chen, Tacoma/Pierce County Health Department: If you are working on economic development and promoting business, why does Anchors exclude private businesses?

Deanna Keller, Port of Tacoma: I would also like to see more $ invested into research and development (environmental) and mentorship of small and minority owned businesses/start ups.

We have to do this together. Thank you Josh for that.

Alex Mather, Pierce Transit: Is it possible to capture the chat content and include it in the meeting notes?

Hunter George, Metro Parks Tacoma: You'll see in the asset map that Joe Sterling and I are wondering about the possibility of engaging Columbia Bank and local credit unions to partner with the types of investments you're talking about here

Andrea Smith, Metro Parks Tacoma: Pierce County Asset Building Coalition is a good resource - contact Sound Outreach

Alex Mather, Pierce Transit: From Sue: United Way and the City are doing pilot but it needs funding from privates to be ongoing. Maybe something like his to encourage small businesses…rent free for 1 year, for example

 RE: Guaranteed Income

Jessie Baines, Metro Parks Tacoma: Does this group see the importance and significance in providing direct financial support and resources to the disenfranchised small businesses? How do we create direct Financial support?!?

**QUESTION 3: Culture – Elizabeth Bonbright**

***What public health lessons from the pandemic should become permanent parts of the Tacoma-Pierce County culture, enshrined in frameworks, policy, infrastructure, activities, and resources? What has the pandemic revealed about the culture and systems that should be updated or removed going forward?***

* Shon Sylvia: We must take this time to redefine/reform childcare and how families need access to affordable childcare. What is the alternative to childcare so people can get out and know their children are safe? What do we want to have happen so we can be strategically building? This is where true systemic change happens. This will be crucial.
* Josh Garcia: Tacoma Public Schools (TPS) is beyond what a conceptual piece looks like. He encouraged Shon to show their business plan and proposal, the work that’s been done with legislature; their resources. TPS is already going, but how do we lean in further in partnership with the multiple agencies? Let’s go!
* Catherine Rudolph: Pierce County is proud of how they handled the CARES Act funding. They made a huge investment in food security (using county reserve funds plus CARES). A heroic moment was when a Nordstrom’s executive quit her job to take over the Bonney Lake food bank. It gave them the ability to set up service centers in outliers of the county, not just the core. Another heroic moment occurred at the beginning of the pandemic, when there weren’t enough masks. A local program aimed at mothers and children made masks, and teams of people from different organizations were distributing masks to places that needed them like nursing homes and to small businesses. This highlights our community resilience: most people are connected in some way, and the volunteerism and warmth and caring from citizens was heartwarming. We need to keep those skills up, and we have to be proud of it.
* Ryan Mello: Childcare is a system that needs investment. We need intentional, ongoing investments, not just shot-in-the-arm, one-time funding fixes. Workforce Central gave a presentation to the county with great ideas. Other issues that we need to invest is upscaling of our workforce (new skills for future economy), investing in education, etc. There are two key investment categories in the American Families Plan: Childcare, Community College, and universal Pre-K. And locally we have the Puget Sound Taxpayer Accountability Account funds, which are supposed to support families and kids. There is $130M reserved just for Pierce County. We should do all we can to help pass the American Family Plan, because we have a lot to gain from it.
* Carla Santorno: One component needs to be imbedded: We need to listen to those we want to serve. We need to listen to how their needs are changing, what they need, and make sure that what we’re doing is helpful.
* Jesse Baines: In a follow-up to Ryan Mello, the pandemic affected minority-owned businesses more harshly. An issue is there is Little funding available to black minority businesses. The Federal Government has been great, but state and local grant and loan opportunities have not been. We need to look at the businesses that have been most affected. These groups need capital to increase their business capacity, but here’s not a high enough emphasis on minority-owned businesses. Whoever’s suffering the most should get funds first. We keep putting pots of money in places that don’t have enough leverage to access the funds. Regarding childcare, the cost has risen dramatically during the pandemic. Many are not able to afford daycare and are having to work at home. We need childcare help for single-family parents, etc. There are groups of people who’ve been significantly hurt by the pandemic.
* Elizabeth Bonbright: Now is definitely the time to invest in childcare and family support.
* Anthony Chen: The pandemic has magnified existing disparities. We don’t want to go back to the old normal – we need to move to a better future. Racial disparities – but also geographic disparities; rural areas; seniors, people with disabilities, etc. We can’t ignore that we have many other disparities. Remember that numbers don’t tell the whole story; we need to recognize the many layers.
* Elizabeth Pauli: Digital Equity needs focused on too, with access to all systems.
* Elizabeth Bonbright: We can see that there’s so much going on in the county. It will benefit the whole community if we can build alignment.

CHAT COMMENTS:

Hunter George, Metro Parks Tacoma: And finally … a third element of an innovative ecosystem is Culture.

What public health lessons from the pandemic should become permanent parts of the Tacoma-Pierce County culture, enshrined in frameworks, policy, infrastructure, activities, and resources?

What did the pandemic reveal about the culture and systems that should be updated or removed going forward?

Tanisha Jumper, City of Tacoma: That’s exactly the point Joe. Co-ops, locally owned business and worker owned enterprises are all end goals of Anchor work. Also local procurement and redirection of funds to locally owned businesses can change the economic ecosystem

Deanna Keller, Port of Tacoma: Affordable housing and childcare. Also, infrastructure.....

Don't forget about workforce training that doesn't involve any college education. There are great jobs here in Pierce County that don't require a college degree.

Josh Garcia, Tacoma Public Schools: Well said Ryan!!!

Alex Mather, Pierce Transit: They can lead US

Deanna Keller, Port of Tacoma: Carla....yes!

Sally Perkins, Community Member: The power and work of mutual aid groups helping people on the ground every day (TMAC, Peoples Assembly, Food Not Bombs, etc.). And at the systems level, the Coalition to End Homelessness is essentially a systems-level mutual aid effort that has been extremely effective.

Deanna Keller, Port of Tacoma: It will cost far less money if we all work together in all of our agencies, which is why we are having this discussion.

Sally Perkins, Community Member: Work with local financial institutions to create a Capital Pool for MWBE businesses.

Jessie Baines, Metro Parks Tacoma: I have another mtg. I need to head out to. Thank you all for your time, conversation and commitment to improving our community :-)

Hunter George, Metro Parks Tacoma:

Here is the link for submitting info for the asset map: <https://docs.google.com/forms/d/e/1FAIpQLSe1nah2tKx1HGHmSCoW3Tt3nIEU69yak-tm-0zgTE2pbU_hBg/viewform>

For any questions about the map, contact me (hunterg@tacomaparks.com) and/or Joe Sterling (joesterling@rfs-llp.com

Deanna Keller, Port of Tacoma: Great conversations everyone! I need to jump into another meeting. Elizabeth and Kristina, please throw me into whatever committee you feel would be best!

Shon Sylvia, Metro Parks Tacoma: Thank you Director Bonbright and Council member Walker for your leadership. Appreciate you and the policy makers trying to rethink the purpose and power of JMAC.

Alex Mather, Pierce Transit: Such great work here. Have a wonderful weekend everyone

Rosa McLeod, City of Tacoma: that was a clap for Hunter!

**Other Issues for the Good of the Order – Elizabeth Bonbright**

The Summit of Sixty will be an all-day, immersive experience, held in the fall.

Before next month’s meeting, we ask that everyone dive deep into our innovation asset map tool, and send Hunter additional items to include.

As an immediate next step to help refine our innovation asset map, we will be creating the following three topical workgroups to include staff and elected from each JMAC entity:

1) Frameworks, Policies, and Infrastructure

2) Activities and Engagement

3) Resources

Chief executives, please begin thinking about who on your staff could work on each workgroup. Electeds please decide which of the workgroups you would like to personally lean into. We will be discussing this in more detail at our next meeting.

**NEXT MEETING:**

The next meeting will be held on Friday, June 11, 2021 from 8:00 am – 9:30 am via ZOOM.

There will be room on the agenda to discuss other JMAC business at the next meeting. If you have a topic you wish to bring to the group, please email Elizabeth Bonbright to get items added to the agenda.

**ADJOURNED:**

Chair Elizabeth Bonbright adjourned the meeting at 9:28 am.